SÃO LUIZ DO PARAITINGA: PICTURES OF THE SÃO PAULO STATE 18TH CENTURY HERITAGE CONSERVATION

PEREIRA DE CAMPOS Rogério¹, RODRIGUES Maria Fernanda², COSTA Anibal³, VARUM Humberto⁴

¹ PhD in Social Sciences, Researcher at Araporã Foundation, Araraquara/SP, Brazil, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6972-5654
² RISCO, Civil Engineering Department, University of Aveiro, Portugal, https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9127-7766
³ RISCO, Civil Engineering Department, University of Aveiro, Portugal, https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8950-4843
⁴ CONSTRUCT-LESE, FEUP, University of Porto, Porto, Portugal, https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0215-8701

ABSTRACT: São Luiz do Paraitinga is a city anchored in time, a unique register of the São Paulo State as regards modern reformulation of the concepts proposed by Marquis of Pombal in the 18th century for Portugal and its colonies. Isolated between mountain-chains, with a strategic position, it was built as a trading post to enhance the transportation of gold and other products to Portugal and also to increase the control of the Portuguese Empire over the production of Brazilian goods. Its heritage remains generally preserved due to its oblivion and remaining static after the favourable ages of local economy. São Luiz do Paraitinga’s architecture, heritage and culture of the 18th century are a singular case that will be analysed in this paper bringing evidence about common people’s life in the Portuguese colony opposing the history of state rulers and great owners.

KEYWORDS: Preservation, Culture, Brazil, São Paulo, Heritage
1. Introduction

Nowadays São Paulo State is the economic centre of Brazil, producing 32% of the Brazilian GDP being the most industrialised region since the beginning of the 20th Century. However, this is a recent scenario of the State in Brazil’s History, very different from the colonial period, in which it functioned in the background for Portugal due to its little wealth.

Although São Paulo had some of the oldest population settlements in the South American Portuguese colony it never stood out as an economic or political administration centre until the 18th Century. In spite of this, the region improved the internal trade within the scope of intermediary trade connecting the producers of the region to the great cities with large commercial demands, especially during the gold cycle of Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso provinces.

São Paulo Captaincy received more attention in the 18th Century because of its strategical military position and the expansion into the Brazilian Plateau, an area of interest to the Portuguese and Spanish empires, the cause of several conflicts, especially in the case of the Union of the Iberian Crowns. Between 1580 and 1640, Portugal lost its administrative independence, but it was able then to explore and colonize territories beyond the Tordesillas Treaty establishment, expanding its domains very fast. With the support of Vatican, it sustained its conquests under the juridical principle of Utis Possidetis, i.e. the ownership by use.

It was inside this captaincy scenario when São Paulo acquired the largest extension and strategical defence importance for the colony with a huge frontier at the time of the Spanish Viceroy. Inside this territory, they developed food production centres and high demand of consumer goods in the main cities, especially in Minas Gerais and, at that time, in the recently established colonial capital Rio de Janeiro (1763). The colonial capital transfer from the Northeast to Southeast is related to the economic importance in different moments, i.e. in the first cycle - the sugarcane plantations (Northeast) and after this, the gold cycle (Southeast).

The irrelevant condition of São Paulo Captaincy can be explained with this administrative submission to Rio de Janeiro Captaincy in 1748, with a joint general-governor. This condition changed with the new administrative model implanted at the Portuguese royal court under coordination of Sebastião José de Carvalho e Melo, the 1st Count of Oeiras and future Marquis of Pombal.

When Marquis of Pombal became the General Secretary of Portugal, he implemented administrative, economic and military changes in the kingdom looking for efficient resources. The empire was passing through an economic crisis after consecutives assaults of the French and Dutch on its colonies, mainly in Brazil. The new secretary of D. José I (King of Portugal) was responsible for bringing Portugal into the Enlightenment Despotism - a monarchical system using scientific and political studies.
Within these changes, Pombal conducted some structural reorganizations in the Brazilian colony that included the transfer of the colonial capital from Salvador to Rio de Janeiro in 1763 and the return of autonomy to São Paulo Captaincy in 1765. He aimed at the military importance of this captaincy and its borders also involving others captaincies, like Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso with their gold mines, to protect the most important Brazilian wealth resources through an essential regional coordination. For this mission, Pombal designated D. Luís Antônio Mourão, the Morgado of Mateus³, as a general-governor between 1765 and 1775 according to Odalia & Caldeira⁴.

Another reason for the establishment of an independent administration in São Paulo was the control of taxes on goods that passed through the captaincy, not only of the gold cargo from Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso, but also of the food products, wood cargos for ship repairs and others. Pombal’s concerns were the contraband transports and tax evasion in a region with several minor harbours without regular fiscalization. This was one of the main reasons to found São Luiz de Paraitinga in 1769 in a specific region without natural resources to explore, but with a strategic position for the mule troops – responsible for the transport of all the goods in the 18th Century – for their refreshment and cargo inspection as well as for people transiting in the region.

Halfway between Taubaté (the main city in the region and the traditional starting point of the Bandeiras into the Brazilian Plateau) and the north coast of the captaincy (with some of the most important harbours at that time), São Luiz do Paraitinga acquired value and population, rising to a village status in 1773, only 4 years after its foundation. Holanda⁵ characterized it as a trooper city established in order to offer respite for the muleteers⁶ carrying goods to the coast and to the Portuguese royal ships. To access the Ubatuba, Caraguatatuba and São Sebastião harbours (the biggest ones on the North coast of (the captaincy) or to connect with Paraty in the Rio de Janeiro captaincy, São Luiz do Paraitinga was an obligatory passage.

Similarly to its fast foundation and growth, its economy collapsed after some decades after the new constructions of the paths to the coast in the captaincy, especially the connection to the harbour of Santos through the Lorena Road in 1792. São Luiz do Paraitinga experienced a new economic boom over the coffee cycle in the 19th Century, but the most important moment to this paper is the first economic cycle of the foundation and city development and its relevance for the history of the São Paulo State.

---
³ Noble title in Portugal conferred by the King; Count of Vila Real and Royal Councelor.
⁶ The Brazilian researchers used the word tropeiros (muleteers in English) to designate the persons responsible for transport of goods with mules in the colony.
2. São Paulo in the second rank

To analyse the emergence of the São Paulo territory, it is necessary to make a journey to the origins of Brazilian history. The study about the discovery and establishment of the Portuguese Empire in South America has a relevant gap from 1500 to 1531, at which time the colonists only established rudimentary exchanges with coastal natives as well as made clearings along the Brazilian coast.

Researches disagree about the first Portuguese settlements in the territory of Brazil due to the lack of records and documents or the parameters used to define those places, like the consideration of permanent presence and the relevance of those places in the initial times. Fausto⁷, considering the little Portuguese settlements (not characterized with village or parish parameters), considered Cananéia (São Paulo) to be the oldest, founded in 1531. Using the criteria of infrastructure, territorial and political organization, there is an ideological confrontation between São Vicente (São Paulo) in 1532 as a village and Salvador (Bahia) in 1549 as a city and the first colonial administrative capital of Brazil.

Yet, this discussion is irrelevant to the analysis of São Paulo; the most important thing is to highlight the first settlements along the Brazilian coast featuring the Southeast region. Beyond the above mentioned Cananéia and São Vicente, it is important to add Espírito Santo in 1535, Santos (São Paulo) in 1536, Iguape (São Paulo) in 1537, Vila da Rainha (Rio de Janeiro) in 1538 and Vitória (Espírito Santo) in 1540. Jesuit José de Anchieta founded the São Paulo province capital (with the same name) in 1554.

The high number of settlements in São Paulo region it can be noticed earlier than the first colonial general-governor was installed in Salvador by Tomé de Souza in 1549. The great volume of quality wood in the Southeast was considered as an important factor to these primary Portuguese settlement choices. However, with the development of northeast sugarcane plantations, the region remained in the background.

Unfortunately, the original buildings built in the 16th century in these cities are lost, with little evidence remaining about the administrative and residential structures. Iguape city, whose Heritage was preserved by CONDEPHAAT⁸ since 1975 possess buildings and material remains of the constructions from the 18th and 19th centuries, with the exception of the gold foundry house, today the city museum, constructed in 1653 and preserved in the downtown. São Vicente has some buildings dating back as far as the city foundation, like the fountain used to supply the population with water.

The lack of urban settings creates a historic gap in the São Paulo society in the first colonial moments and the sparse buildings contribute to the analysis of the structural ideas and conceptions but not the social and political organization. Despite having several early settlements in the territory of Brazil, the region did not have sufficient economic relevance to attract the investments of the

---

Portuguese empire. So, due to lack of raw materials close to these living centres, it was necessary to use not as resistant constructions materials as in Salvador.

As the first Brazilian capital in the colonial period, Salvador emerged as a city under Portuguese architectural influence of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries in its urban organisation and buildings construction process. The Baroque concepts can be seen throughout the historical centre, mainly built with imported materials from Portugal such as tiles, lioz stones, ironwork produced by artisans and builders from the metropolis. Its main buildings, such as the churches and administrative buildings were constructed in stone, contributing to its durability until the present, while the residences of the poor population disappeared from downtown.

São Paulo, in the same period, experienced a shortage of raw materials and financial resources, with no detected sources of durable materials such as stones or investments in the production of adobes. Therefore, the solution was the association of simple techniques resorting not only to Portuguese knowledge but also to indigenous and African slaves’ construction knowledge: rammed earth and cob wall construction techniques. Until the nineteenth century, these were the main techniques of buildings construction. Architect Luís Saia\(^9\) refers:

> The history of São Paulo urban buildings of this period is the survival history of rammed earth as a construction process deeply associated with the regional development. The buildings that ventured into the use of brick could be counted by fingers. Afterwards, they were widely disseminated through the intervention of professionals (masters of work) of European origin, mainly Italians. Nevertheless, it has always been an aristocratic process of construction and, although in some sense degraded by the poor organization of professional work, it remained in the area of São Paulo until complete replacement of the traditional processes. (Translated from Portuguese, by the author).

According to Holanda\(^10\), the process of rammed earth and cob wall constructions was a synthesis of the early miscegenation through which the captaincy of São Paulo passed and it was spread throughout Brazil through a natural or imposed coexistence of Europeans, natives and Africans slaves. Bandeirantes\(^11\) groups did not accidentally emerge in this captaincy, but as work force was needed in the slavery production system in a region of too low economic resources to buy African slaves, they had to search for natives to supply this demand.

The irrelevance of the São Paulo territory for the Portuguese Empire can be observed in this aspect in a period when the Jesuits and the Catholic Church repudiated the slavery of natives, called “gentios”, claiming they were innocent souls who were to be converted to Catholicism.

---


11. Bandeirantes: In English the word means Flagmen, due to the expeditions carrying a flag of the Portuguese Empire. The Bandeirantes were a non-official army composed of the first descendants of Portuguese settlers mixed with the natives and Africans, one of the origins of the multicultural Brazilian population nowadays. Ribeiro D., *O povo brasileiro*, São Paulo: Companhia de Bolso, 2003. p. 435.
In bigger cities, indigenous slavery was rejected and socially condemned, but in most of the São Paulo cities of the 17th and 18th centuries, they were the main labour force and the goal of Bandeirantes’ expeditions through the interior of Brazil. Besides African slaves who arrived from regions like Benguela, Congo and Sudan with knowledge about mud and wood constructions, the natives from borderlands such as Mato Grosso, Goiás and even Amazonas were brought to work in São Paulo, some of them also with knowledge in construction techniques similar to cob wall and rammed earth techniques. Therefore, without any need to learn other construction techniques and with the lack of other raw materials, rammed earth was the main building system in São Paulo.

Some researchers incorrectly associated this technique and the simplicity of decorations in São Paulo buildings of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries with just a poor society or a captaincy without richness. What started as an economic process turned out to be an independent choice of social classes due to easiness and speed in construction of buildings. In the eighteenth century the captaincy did not have any gold mines like other regions, however, it developed a complex warehouse trading system that resulted in profits for Portugal and the production of consumer goods for the rest of the Brazilian colony.

The slavery cycle commerce between the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries became as profitable as the sugar production for the Portuguese crown itself and was maintained until its abolishment by the English in the nineteenth century. The internal trade of goods in Brazil brought a profit equivalent to that from the slave trade for the captaincy of São Paulo as estimated by Blaj\textsuperscript{12}. Routes for the muleteers for transporting of food from the South to the other regions were required as well as the passage for the gold freight from Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso until the change of the route to the ports in Rio de Janeiro.

Holanda\textsuperscript{13} tries to analyse the importance of this transport and the commerce of São Paulo, which served as an intermediate trader between the consumer centers - especially the cities of Minas Gerais - and the producers of the southern region. The author reports that the largest number of muleteers was registered in 1754, composed of 3780 mules carrying food products from Rio Grande do Sul to the captaincy of Minas Gerais. The supply demand of these troops generated great profits for the merchants of the captaincy of São Paulo as well as the trade of mules that were raised in the pampas (Rio Grande do Sul) and sold in the city of Sorocaba, near the São Paulo capital.

There is no reliable data about tax collection during this period, but Holanda\textsuperscript{14} ensures that it was enough for a primitive elite to emerge in the state. It was not comparable to the Minas Gerais elite of the eighteenth century arising from the exploration of the gold and gemstones. The muleteers system was only changed with the arrival of the railway around 1875, ensuring a gap of more than a century to São Paulo’s commerce.

\textsuperscript{13} Holanda S. B., Caminhos e fronteiras, São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1994.
\textsuperscript{14} Ibidem.
The great concern for São Paulo’s economy occurred in the Pombal period with appointment of the Morgado de Mateus as the general-governor of the captaincy in 1765, also motivated by the proximity to the new capital of the colony, Rio de Janeiro. The general secretary of the Portuguese Empire noticed not only the commercial potential of Sao Paulo but also the evasion of payments into the treasury in the region with its low fiscalized tracks that encouraged smuggling. It was at this time that São Luiz do Paraitinga was established in 1769 on an official route called Estrada Real (Royal Road) connecting the auriferous regions with the ports of the southeastern region.

3. São Luiz do Paraitinga

São Luiz do Paraitinga was founded in 1769 under the guidance of the São Paulo’s general-governor, Luís Antonio de Sousa Botelho Mourão, known as Morgado de Mateus in Brazilian history books. During his governance (1765 - 1775), together with Serra do Mar\textsuperscript{15} city, 20 other cities and villages emerged in different points of the São Paulo’s territory. This is the indicator of the expansion process to occupy the captaincy and a new government model of a technical and well-informed organization uncommon in the Portuguese colony in that period.

This was the area of a confrontation between the Portuguese and Spanish empires to control the hinterland of the South American Plateau, generating frequent border conflicts when the area was expanded through the Bandeirantes’ expeditions. As Canabrava\textsuperscript{16} argues, this territory was an occupational vacuum occupied by a population of 63,228 inhabitants in 19 villages and 38 parishes, 25% of the population being present in the space defined by the city of São Paulo and parishes within a radius of 80 km\textsuperscript{17}. The great land availability was not attractive to settlers and immigrants because the captaincy was outside the Brazil’s economic axis.

Official records indicating that no parish or settlement was elevated to the village category in the province since 1705\textsuperscript{18} contrast with the management of Morgado de Mateus who, in just a decade, established 20 new settlements, one of them being São Luiz do Paraitinga. Beginning from strategic geographic reorganization used by the general-governor, through maps analysis, censuses\textsuperscript{19} and statistical surveys about military forces and economy, Morgado de Mateus was the first model of efficient administrative organization in Brazil, inspired by the Enlightenment principles of French scientists propagated in the period. The reorganisation of the captaincy was

\textsuperscript{15} Serra do Mar (Sea Sierra) is the name of the mountain-chain in the South of Brazil with 1500 km stretching close to the coast with high altitudes between 800 and 2300 meters. São Luiz do Paraitinga was founded in the middle of this mountain-chain and was known as Sierra City because of this.


\textsuperscript{17} Important highlight: In 1709, São Paulo Captaincy territory was around 2.5 million km\textsuperscript{2}, i.e. 30% of Brazil’s territory.


\textsuperscript{19} Officially, the first census in Brazil occurred only in 1872, during the reign of Emperor D. Pedro II. However, the archive of São Paulo keeps several notes of Morgado de Mateus and his successors about population surveys being conducted since 1765.
not a casual choice of Marquis of Pombal. Its central economic importance for the Portuguese Empire as the fundamental military area to defend the recently discovered gold reserves and the territory expansion through Bandeirantes’ expeditions were determinant in this case.

São Luiz do Paraitinga became the most influential one and represents the rationality city of Morgado de Mateus under São Paulo’s command, hence its importance to historical analysis for the colonial society in the period. Certainly, the city was not the only one influenced by the Enlightenment city concept - the definition created by José Eduardo Horta Correia in 1985, which denotes a strong government intervention in the social control and occupation of space. Other Brazilian cities, such as Belém (Pará), São Luiz (Maranhão), Icó and Aracati (Ceará), received this organizational influence, but, in the official records of the cities founded in the Brazilian territory, São Luiz do Paraitinga is the only one completely planned and implemented under the administrator’s (Morgado de Mateus) determination and supervision.

São Luiz do Paraitinga emerged with a specific purpose - as a trading post and accommodation for mule troopers, who transported goods from the countryside to the Brazilian coast. It was strategically built in a location of great difficulty with new paths leading to it rather than the indigenous trails widely used by the population in the 18th century. It is halfway between the cities of Taubaté and Ubatuba. The first one, founded in 1645, became the starting point of the Bandeirantes expeditions and the second one, founded in 1637, was one of São Paulo’s major ports over the 17th and 18th centuries.

The geographic aspect of the region where São Luiz do Paraitinga was founded - inserted into a great mountain chain called Serra do Mar with 1500-kilometre length and stretching from Santa Catarina to Rio de Janeiro, made it difficult to cross this natural barrier. With 800 meters of average height, this mountain chainade the communication between the coast and the plateau difficult, reaching in some places the altitudes of 2300 meters. In the Ubatuba region, there existed an indigenous trail that led to the São Paulo hinterland even before the Portuguese arrival, working as a communication route between different tribes, surpassing the altitude of 880 meters above the sea level and going into the valleys between mountains. It was a 10-kilometer trail winding around the mountains and connecting the Paraíba Valley to the captaincy’s northern shores.

The Paraitinga River (that means clear waters in Tupi language) is located in one of these valleys with one of the lowest altitudes in the region (741 meters) and surrounded by tropical forests. The Paraitinga River had all the characteristics desired by the settlers and travellers of colonial Brazil: a great flow of crystalline water and a low slope riverbed with a few waterfalls, which allowed capturing of potable water without problems. This place had another important component, i.e. the distance between the established cities - 43 kilometres away from Taubaté and 53 kilometres from Ubatuba, which was an ideal distance to build a roadhouse for troopers and travellers.

That was the main factor that made Morgado de Mateus to directly plan and stimulate the construction of São Luiz do Paraitinga in 1769, which is also reflected in the rapid rise of the settlement to a parish in 1773. The general-governor participated in the elaboration of the initial parish project, with orthogonal and geometric streets of identical sizes, symmetric facades of
the mansions and houses that were to be built. There was a concern for the organization and rational aesthetics that was conflicting with the Baroque designs of other cities as well as an administrative logic that desired better inspection and control of activities.

On the 8th of May 1769, Morgado de Mateus appointed sergeant-master Manoel Antonio de Carvalho the founder and mayor of the new village, sending financial and material resources for the fast construction of the new parish. After 2 years, much of the original city layout was already completed under the rigidly established norms and, in 1773, it reached the village status.

Even though it was settled in a valley of a great mountain chain, resources like stone and lime were scarce, but there was plenty of tropical wood and moldable clay near the centre of the city. The high costs of stone transportation made the use of this material unviable, encouraging the use of a well-known technique for most of the local citizens - the rammed earth. The wood used in the support structures and roof constructions had an advantage because the local area was surrounded by the Atlantic forest and for that reason the inhabitants had access to noble wood types with high humidity resistance and long durability, which was visible after the 2010 river flood.

São Luiz do Paraitinga benefited from the great gold extraction period in Minas Gerais, combined with the voluntary tax of Portugal collected from 1756 with the purpose of assisting the reconstruction of Lisbon after the earthquake of 1755, which destroyed a great part of Lisbon's downtown. This tax was an offer for the men of power in exchange for leases or sale of Brazilian territories, according to Romeiro and Botelho, and was fundamental to financing the reconstruction of the imperial capital, thus creating the elite of property owners in the eighteenth-century colony. This tax was collected until 1809, being then abolished by D. João VI.

São Luiz do Paraitinga, as a trooper city that was idealized, lived two great economic cycles of development in its history, which lead to the construction of the big houses in the city centre and after that was forgotten in the middle of the mountains until the present times. The first cycle, as already highlighted, was the gold and gemstones exploration period in Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso, when the importance of gold transportation brought richness to the city and the government of São Paulo captaincy. Gold was explored in the mining cities and its destination was the coast and the Portuguese metropolis. The second cycle was the coffee period that spread in the São Paulo state in the second half of the 19th century and at the beginning of the 20th century, creating rural elite in the city that disappeared in the Brazilian industrialization period, thus freezing the city in time.

The first local economic cycle and the consequences for the city are the most relevant period for this paper, especially its consolidation and growth. The significant increase of mule troops traveling along the road that connected the Brazilian plateau to São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro harbour made São Luiz do Paraitinga an obligatory local pause for all travellers before crossing Serra do Mar and reaching the coast. Until the end of the eighteenth century, the importance of the city in the transportation of merchandise was crucial as a connection that saved time and effort due to a quick trail surpassing

---

the great mountains and reaching close harbour cities on the northern coast of São Paulo such as Ubatuba, Caraguatuba and São Sebastião as well as the City of Paraty in Rio de Janeiro.

Two factors were decisive for a decrease in the relevance of São Luiz do Paraítinga in transportation of goods to Portugal, which drove this roadhouse muleteer city to an economic recession. The first factor occurred outside the São Paulo Captaincy: the construction of Nova Estrada Real (New Royal Road) that connected the main cities of Minas Gerais directly to the Rio de Janeiro harbour, significantly reducing the mule troops that travelled along the old official road.

With a direct connection to the new colony’s capital, the New Royal Road enabled not only a reduction of the travelling time, but also a greater fiscal control of gold extraction and transport from Minas Gerais. This new route enabled a connection of Minas Gerais cities with the coast in a short period of 14 days, almost half the previous one that required 25 days of travelling. São Luiz do Paraítinga was left out as part of the Old Royal Road - still used by some mule troops, but with a very reduced transport of gold from Minas Gerais. It is speculated that the old route was used by smugglers to avoid the crown taxes - one of the main reasons why Morgado de Mateus founded a city in an obligatory passage area in the mountainous region.

The second and most important factor for the economy of São Luiz do Paraítinga and its oblivion until the coffee boom was the construction of Calçada do Lorena (Lorena Sidewalk) in 1792. The access routes that led to the north coast existed even before the Portuguese presence in the Brazilian territory as trails and paths opened by natives to connect the region of São Paulo’s capital with the coast. A great number of these connections were available in the northern coast of the captaincy. For this reason, the Portuguese choice of harbour locations in São Paulo benefited from this improvement. Although they were not the closest distance to the capital, they supported different regions like Minas Gerais and Mato Grosso. Despite the construction of the New Royal Road and redirection of great part of the gold mined in Minas Gerais, almost all gold production of Mato Grosso still transited through these roads in the São Paulo northern region, bringing wealth to the cities of the Paraíba Valley.

Calçada do Lorena - the largest infrastructure constructed by the Portuguese Empire, with a high investment, denotes the importance that São Paulo Captaincy obtained as Brazil’s trade centre. Bernardo José Maria de Lorena, the general-governor of São Paulo Captaincy from 1786 to 1797, named the road and ordered its construction. European visitants in the 19th century admired the construction of Calçada do Lorena, taking into consideration the adverse conditions of the region and the lack of material to execute the work. Built in stone with the support of the Real Corps of Engineers of Lisbon, it became the main connection of the São Paulo city to the Santos’s harbour, crossing the Serra do Mar mountains with 50 kilometres being totally paved and enabling a faster connection of the São Paulo capital to the Toledo coast21.

The new road and the massive redirection of São Paulo’s production as well as transportation of gold from Mato Grosso to Santos’s harbour resulted in an economic stagnation of the Paraíba Valley region leading cities like Ubatuba, São Sebastião and São Luiz do Paraítinga to an economic recession. The city formerly idealized as a trading and fiscal control post began to lose...

---

its function, only recovering its economy with the coffee production in the second half of the 19th century. One piece of historical evidence confirming this recession was the fact that it was only in 1857 that São Luiz do Paraítinga was elevated to the rank of a city\textsuperscript{22}, which occurred during the coffee cycle.

The oblivion and isolation of the city inserted in Mares de Morros (Ocean of Hills), as defined by the geographer Aziz Ab’Saber\textsuperscript{23}, was an essential factor in preservation of its structure and buildings suffering few interventions over the centuries. The term ‘frozen city’ refers to few changes of São Luiz do Paraítinga as regards administrative and urban aspects; thus, in the 2010 Census, it had a population of 10,397 inhabitants - a close number to that of 1830 (around 9,000 residents)\textsuperscript{24}. Currently, the small agricultural production, as the largest economic occupation of the population, has been replaced by historical tourism. This slow transition inaugurates a new economic cycle of the city, with tourism bringing a financial contribution for the preservation of the historical heritage.

According to official data from the city’s Tourism Department, only during the street carnival of 2012 the city’s financial turnover was USD 4.3 million, while its total budget for the same year was approximately USD 7.7 million. The potential growth of historical and sustainable tourism has currently gained more importance in Brazil and the city of São Luiz do Paraítinga has a prominent position because of its well preserved 18th century urban settlement.

The 2010 flood had a great impact on the city, especially on the local population due to the loss not only of the material heritage but also of the immaterial space of celebration, with all the city churches being destroyed as well as the city market and the municipal library. Until the tragic moment, the IPHAN\textsuperscript{25} had not conducted any city registration process as regards its preservation and, consequently, there was an irreparable loss of original documents, such as building plans and legal documents about the city cultural heritage.

\textsuperscript{22} The definitions of Portuguese city organizations are not clear being a combination of factors like total inhabitants, number of urban houses, economic relevance and political efforts. In São Luiz do Paraítinga the most relevant one was the political influence of Morgado de Mateus.

\textsuperscript{23} Ab’Saber A., Os domínios de natureza no Brasil, São Paulo: Ateliê Editorial, 2005.

\textsuperscript{24} Data available on the website of IBGE (Statistical and Geographical Brazilian Institute): www.ibge.gov.br.

\textsuperscript{25} IPHAN: National Historic and Artistic Heritage Institute.
4. Policy and institutional weaknesses

Beyond all the natural difficulties that exist as regards preservation and recovery of the heritage, in Brazil there are other problems of bureaucratic nature that delay the maintenance of this heritage or even make it unviable. Factors such as the huge size of the country and the fragmentation of laws in individual states and counties, leads national entities like the IPHAN to find many restrictions for execution of their work. It is important to highlight this point to analyse the particular case of São Luiz do Paraitinga and how, despite the tragic event, it could minimize its heritage loss.

It is not a common factor for all regions, but in the case of São Paulo, this bureaucratic sphere is even greater, causing delays and difficulties in the execution of conservation works as well as doubts about who will provide the necessary funds. In spite of there being heritage defence and conservation institutions for at least 40 years, it was only in December 2013 that cooperation between the IPHAN, CONDEPHAAT and CONPRESP was established for administrative solutions about heritage buildings in the São Paulo city.

There was a previous unofficial dialogue between these institutions, but it was not possible to establish an official link for coordination or to get complementary funds from different sources. The only other similar example in Brazil occurred in Bahia more than 30 years ago - a successful initiative that demonstrates that the barriers to action are not decisions motivated by the employees and consultants of these three different institutions.

One of the factors that facilitated the creation of this shared office was the fragility of the institutions themselves in recent years, which has been hampering not only their technical functioning but also the processes of demands for preservation by the society, thus generating great delays. Especially in the São Paulo city, the CONPRESP faces difficulties due to a drastic reduction of its staff and investments. In 2002, the city council had 60 employees working in all stages of cataloguing and heritage preservation. In 2015, the number of employees was 18, mainly elderly employees near the retirement age.

As a result, there was a worsening in the stretching of deadlines in the official conservation process in the city and lack of any possibility of a combined action of the other institutions due to conflicting legal issues. The creation of the Technical Office of Shared Management was intended to relieve the number of stagnant processes in the city hall institutions and forward them into the legal sphere - the final stage of the preservation process.

In the case of São Luiz do Paraitinga, the problem was not so complicated as it involved only the state and federal spheres. In spite of this, it also created conflicts pointed out by analysts as one of the reasons for the city’s lack of supervision and support before the 2010 river overflow. It is

---

28 CONPRESP: Town Council for Preservation of Historic, Cultural and Environmental Heritage of the São Paulo City.
very important to highlight the importance of these institutions to analyse the impact of various bureaucratic spheres on the Heritage preservation, as Pereira\(^\text{29}\) explains.

The IPHAN was the first institution to carry out studies on the city under the responsibility of the architect Luís Saia (São Paulo's IPHAN consultant) and the historian Jaelson Trindade in 1972, examining historical buildings and local culture. The researchers already emphasized the importance of São Luiz do Paraitinga and its unique characteristics as an Enlightenment city model, uncommon in the Brazilian territory. They also referred to the city as the best example of this construction from its very foundation, planned and executed with a technical rigor in the 18\(^{\text{th}}\) century. Until 1982, the only building in the city catalogued by the IPHAN was the house where Oswaldo Cruz - an internationally renowned sanitary medicine specialist was born, which was inscribed into the Federal Institute's historical book number 315 in 1956.

With Luís Saia's death in 1975, the IPHAN studies and analysis of the city stopped and the researches shared the results with the CONDEPHAAT. It was only in 1976 that the IPHAN regional management was created, taking an increased insight into the local needs through its division into different teams, no longer centralized in Brasília, which was beneficial for the São Luiz do Paraitinga research.

The CONDEPHAAT is the state institute responsible for surveying and protecting of historical material. It was the first one to declare São Luiz do Paraitinga downtown as heritage in 1981 based on the studies of the architect Gustavo Neves da Rocha - a researcher at the University of São Paulo (USP) and a CONDEPHAAT consultant since 1979. As a result, the city received tax exemptions and funds from the São Paulo State Government to conserve its buildings, yet without any scenario for a detailed study of the surrounding. It was only in 2002 that the city was classified as a tourist town, which guaranteed the protection not only for the material but also immaterial heritage, covering the local traditional culture and the environment around the city.

The CONDEPHAAT technicians' evaluation methodology considered more the touristic potential of the city having its profitability than the relevance of the urban historical and cultural value, turning its actions towards the increase of tourism. The state council is subject to the São Paulo State Department of Culture and under its orders; therefore preservation actions follow a hierarchical bureaucratic structure that restricts the council's autonomy.

After its designation as the State Touristic Resort, a cultural promotion program to publicise the special characteristics of São Luiz do Paraitinga was created, exploring its unique scenery in terms of preservation. However, there was no inspection or maintenance routine service specialized in maintenance and preservation of these secular buildings. The government limited itself to a transfer of touristic funds. A part of the CONDEPHAAT’s omission condemned the local society to irreparable losses in the city that demanded protection against floods, which was an old agenda of the local politicians.

As a consequence of the CONDEPHAAT constraints (actions and investments), the presence of the IPHAN was requested to return to the city. It was only in 2006 that new urban studies were prepared within the Action Plan for 2007 by the IPHAN local agenda department for studies on historical cities. The analysis intended to take account of the complete urban area of São Luiz do Paraitinga in a project that involved more than only the historical centre, but also all representative buildings of the regional historical trajectory. Due to the limited investments and the reduced number of technicians to analyse more than 400 buildings of the 18th and 19th centuries, the report was not completed before the flood of 2010. After this natural catastrophe, the IPHAN catalogued the urban centre of São Luiz do Paraitinga in emergency conditions.

Again, there was a great criticism of the society for the slowness of these institutions in drawing up not only the reports but also the documentation for the city preservation. The lack of cooperation and the political conflicts in the different spheres of power created impasses that resulted in the lack of prevention against natural disasters that would compromise the rammed earth and cob wall constructions. With previous studies carried out from 1972, the preservation of São Luiz do Paraitinga should be a priority just like the studies on overflowing accidents of the river Paraitinga that is very close to the historical downtown.

Another important aspect of the IPHAN’s preservation of urban settlements is the institute’s independence from local and even federal policies. When Getúlio Vargas founded it in 1936, the institute’s legal bases guaranteed its autonomy since it is incorporated into the Ministry of Culture until now. However, this level of freedom and impact is rare in Brazil. The institute can only have its decisions revoked by the President through a petition that must be analysed by the Federal Supreme Court. Thus, if a building appears in the entity’s record book, this guarantees that the construction will be safe from local government’s interference or even from invasive property speculation.

In addition, the IPHAN is a unique old institution with public support that still operates in Brazil. Being managed independently and under the tutelage of great researchers, it has an image of excellence and social reference for the heritage preservation, which avoids corruptible political negotiations that exist in other sectors where high positions are political. This is one reason for the longevity of the institute, which, with more than 80 years of its existence, still continues to carry out work appreciated by the Brazilian society and crucial to the historical memory of Brazil.

The financial and technical limitations also interfere in the performance of these institutions, especially in the case of the IPHAN. With its budget of USD 4.3 million and around 700 employees since 2016 for operating throughout Brazil, the slowness of the processes cannot be assigned to inefficiency of the institute, which needs to monitor and preserve 87 urban complexes and more than 5000 buildings, not to mention the immaterial and cultural heritage. Low investments of some states, especially in the north-eastern region, which has a decisive historical relevance for the country, have led to the institute’s efforts in these locations, as well as in other states like São Paulo, to be left to the protection of a respective state government.

The CONDEPHAAT also has a limited budget - around USD 1 million in 2016, and is composed of 25 councillors elected as representatives in heritage and historical preservation studies conducted.
in the state. Its staff and technicians are also limited: 30 people who need to work in the entire state of São Paulo. Registration by the institute is only effective locally and needs to be reassessed by the IPHAN to gain national validation, which contributes to an increase in the registration process time. It also needs to be subject to the approval of the State Secretariat of Culture and sanctioned by the Governor. If the technical criteria of an analysis are considered insufficient by the IPHAN, it ends up carrying out new research to determine the importance of the site.

After the 2010 disaster in the city of São Luiz do Paraitinga and several compromised historical buildings, both institutes decided to create an emergency cooperation to rebuild the city. Faced with complete destruction of several buildings and the urgent need to reestablish the local society functionalities, some historical aspects were ignored and the visual design was prioritized over traditional construction methods in an attempt to preserve the symbolic capital for the citizens, although this represents a loss of heritage that has remained intact since the 18th century.

4.1. The Eggshell Theory

In order to evaluate the historical importance of the heritage in any sphere, whether it is just a building, a group of buildings or the whole urban set, it is necessary to take into account not only the aesthetic and material importance. The cultural and symbolic aspects were also a component of these old constructions, as considered by the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS).

After São Luiz do Paraitinga’s historical city centre was flooded in 2010, an immediate conflict arose between restoring of the city into its normal life and preserving of the heritage. The commotion in the face of the tragedy pressed the public authorities for immediate solutions and induced the São Paulo government to take a political and non-technical decision in the case. The reconstruction process was directed towards returning of the city’s functionality, regardless of how it would be conducted, leaving a gap as regards the symbolic and historical issues.

The government feared that conducting of São Luiz do Paraitinga’s reconstruction with the use of traditional construction processes will probably result in a similar tragedy again, especially for buildings of rammed earth and cob wall. The durability or compatibility of the construction system used in the 18th and 19th centuries in the region was not evaluated, ignoring the good condition of the buildings before 2010.

The Capela das Mercês (Mercy Chapel) is a good example of this reconstruction system as the second oldest church in the city with its origins dating back to the end of the 18th century and having been inaugurated in 1819. The building had a unique characteristics of the particular São Paulo architectural style - a contrast between the dominant Baroque in the colonial period and the Neoclassical architecture. The church was built with the use of rammed earth with aspects of the Portuguese 17th century architecture, yet with the appropriate adjustments to the local climate, such as the roof overhung extension to safeguard the sensitive rammed earth walls.
After the flood of 2010, the whole church was destroyed with only one rammed earth wall of 1.10 meters remaining. This portion was all the material used in the building reconstruction as an illustration of the original construction process. There was no evaluation of the reconstruction using a similar process. The IPHAN technicians chose modern and faster processes such as brick and concrete systems. The urgency to retake the religious and symbolic activities obstructed a detailed process of the IPHAN to evaluate a more suitable reconstruction methodology to be used.

Similarly, others buildings followed the model of replacing the traditional process of construction with modern ones, preserving only the external visual aspect, and thus the local tourist appeal for attracting resources. It was thought this would be a faster reconstruction method. As it happens in all great catastrophes, there is an initial solidarity moment and mobilization to help people and the place, followed by long periods of reconstruction and return to the forgotten routine, not because of any lack of sensitivity but due to the instant need to solve problems.

Different entities as well as the federal and state governments supported São Luiz do Paraitinga in finding of emergency solutions. The search for instant solutions was an under-pressure imposition of the society unable to think about the importance of the rehabilitation process of a historical city without changing of its original characteristics.

The touristic potential of the city was placed as the main attraction of the investments by the state government and the main reason for the accelerated visual reconstruction of São Luiz do Paraitinga, where the return to commercial activities would be the key to attract financial resources. The IPHAN points to the state administrative sphere as regards the responsibility for the tragedy. The lack of attention to the heritage city contributed to a tragedy which involved not only the São Paulo government but also IPHAN and CONDEPHAAT.

This situation led to the emergence of the Eggshell Model in the rehabilitation of São Luiz do Paraitinga historical downtown, preserving the buildings facades with the use of contemporary constructions of concrete and masonry. The historical importance of the city, the cultural and social analysis since its foundation period and the society of São Paulo of the 18th Century were suppressed, leaving only the allegory of what was once the city. For tourists that only seek visual representation, without importance of the local culture built through the centuries and constituting a relevant part of the Brazilian history, this sells the symbolic capital that is sought. The local inhabitants remain with a loss of their traditions and culture imposed by a distant order from the national authorities for a certain restricted area according to Lefebvre.

The eggshell is an analogy to this partial rehabilitation model of historical structures in use, where all that can be observed is about the external visual aspect. Only after this shell is broken, can we be sure if the eggs themselves are good or deteriorated. At first, all eggs are in a perfect condition when viewed from the outside. When consumers buy the eggs, they will only be sure that they are perfect when breaking that shell and looking inside. It is the same when the

---

real originality can only be analysed through the interior of these buildings. However, like in a theatre, the spectator is not allowed to look behind the stage to avoid destroying of the illusion. The contrast between the real and the imaginary is the main aspect of this accelerated reconstruction, which does not affect tourism as the major source of resources, but inflicts a cultural loss on the residents. In this superficial model other losses are not considered, such as the destruction of official documents, photographs, iconographies and others items that exist in private residences and in the municipal library. Some documents and original plans are in the São Paulo city under the CONDEPHAAT protection, however, the majority of original documents were in the city when the 2010 flood occurred.

The reconstruction and production of models similar to the originals by the IPHAN are not exactly a copy of what existed. A very common problem in Brazil is dealing with the consequences instead of treating the causes, which would prevent disasters in different spheres. The real intention now is to repair a mistake that could have been avoided, yet as regards the protection and preservation of the city’s original documentation since its origin, much of that was lost. Not only the IPHAN but also the CONDEPHAAT were co-responsible for the slowness in collecting data and historical archiving, and thus only fragments of the documents have remained until now.

As a result, there emerged imprecisions about the original floor constructions plans, especially concerning the occupied space. The incompatibility between the thickness of masonry walls and those traditional rammed earth and cob wall ones creates distortions in the internal space as compared to to Saia’s\textsuperscript{32} [16] studies. In addition, the original structure and construction architectural solutions of the 18\textsuperscript{th} and 19\textsuperscript{th} centuries used in the walls and roofs are lost. The loss is even deeper in the academic aspect for the cultural analysis and reconstructions as well as for the population that loses its traditional space and its bond with a familiar structure. The houses internal climatization was neither taken into account, whereas the cob wall and rammed earth are good thermal insulators protecting from the local weather in a mountainous area with abrupt climatic variations, which was not analysed in the reconstruction process.

5. Final Considerations

The symbolic, material and cultural losses in São Luiz do Paraítinga are immeasurable for the history of São Paulo and small Brazilian cities of the colonial period as one of the last samples of the 18\textsuperscript{th} and 19\textsuperscript{th} centuries that were preserved. The slowness of the IPHAN to conserve the urban set as well as the lack of monitoring of the urban risk area led to great cultural losses when the 2010 flood occurred.

São Paulo has its cultural roots related to the history of Bandeirantes and their prowess, with few examples of this history in the form of original physical evidence such as buildings from that period. The protection of the largest collection that was created in the historic region of Bandeirantes’ expeditions was neglected by letting the Paraitinga River waters erase an important line from its past.

The reconstruction preserved the visual and symbolic representation of São Luiz do Paraitinga over the centuries, but the tradition and culture losses for the population are permanent. What was more symbolic to São Paulo State as its identity, i.e. the rammed earth and cob wall construction processes, was deeply destroyed by the catastrophe, leaving an irreparable loss for the paulista or caipira\(^{33}\) architectural style.

São Luiz do Paraitinga remained unchanged over the centuries due to being forgotten by the progress and accelerated changes of industrialization in São Paulo. Yet, the same oblivion condemned it to the lack of material and immaterial heritage protection against possible natural catastrophes like the 2010 flood. The Paraitinga River and the environmental changes caused by the altering climate were the agents of destruction, but not the only ones responsible.

“ELARCH project: Reference number 552129-EM-1-2014-1-IT-ERA MUNDUS-EMA21 funded with the support of the European Commission. This document only reflects the author’s view and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.”

---

\(^{33}\) Paulista designated a person born in the São Paulo State; Caipira is a name for the São Paulo countryside population and the specific culture related to them.
Bibliography


Internet references


IBGE. Statistical and Geographic Brazilian Institute. 2016. Available in: <www.ibge.gov.br>