

Bhopal Disaster Gas Victims': Trauma Before & During the COVID-19 Pandemic

Ofiary katastrofy gazowej w Bhopalu: trauma przed i podczas pandemii COVID-19

Monalisha Mandal¹, Md. Mojibur Rahman²

*Department of Humanities and Social Sciences,
Indian Institute of Technology (Indian School of Mines), Dhanbad, Jharkhand, 826004, India*

¹*E-mail: monalishamandal2015@gmail.com, ORCID ID 0000-0002-6765-643X*

²*E-mail: mrahmanelt@gmail.com, ORCID ID 0000-0002-8454-0981*

Abstract

Many studies, reports, books, narratives, and surveys have focused on the disputable picture of the sustainable development of victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster to understand the trauma, faced by the victims and survivors before and during the COVID-19 period. Traumatic accidents fundamentally shatter the time-based experience of humans between the present and the past. The poisonous night not only had an intense effect on their way of life, but also had an acute impact on their understanding of how to deal with problems. However, another whammy COVID-19 makes their lives more traumatized, unsustainable, and also the victims of another catastrophe. The researchers of the present study have attempted to focus on the traumatic conditions and lessons faced by the Bhopal Gas Victims. In short, the present study puts the focus on the disputable record of sustainable development of the Bhopal Gas Victims in duration, from 1984 to the COVID-19 period, through an analysis of different studies.

Key words: disputable, sustainable development, Bhopal gas victims, COVID-19, trauma

Streszczenie

Wiele badań, raportów, książek, narracji i ankiet skupiało się na kontrowersyjnym obrazie ofiar katastrofy gazowej w Bhopalu, aby zrozumieć traumę, z jaką borykają się ofiary i osoby, które przeżyły, przed i w trakcie okresu COVID-19. Traumatyczne wypadki zasadniczo niszczą doświadczenie ludzi między teraźniejszością a przeszłością. Trująca noc nie tylko wywarła ogromny wpływ na ich styl życia, ale także znacząco wpłynęła na ich zrozumienie, jak radzić sobie z problemami. Jednak kolejna katastrofa w postaci COVID-19 sprawia, że ich życie staje się jeszcze bardziej traumatyczne i niezrównoważone. Naukowcy biorący udział w niniejszym badaniu podjęli próbę skupienia się na traumatycznych stanach i lekcjach, z jakimi borykają się ofiary katastrofy gazowej z Bhopalu. Analizujemy kontrowersyjny zapis rozwoju ofiar katastrofy gazowej z Bhopalu w okresie od 1984 do epidemii COVID-19.

Słowa kluczowe: niepewność, zrównoważony rozwój, ofiary katastrofy gazowej w Bhopalu, COVID-19, trauma

Introduction

The 1984 Bhopal Gas Disaster not only depicts the pictures of the failure of the system and justice, but also gives a picture of the disputable sustainable development of the victims' of the World's Worst Industrial Disaster. The thirty-five years of struggle of the victims include a large number of lessons for the coming days of their troubles. But, now it is time

for assessment. Once again the survivors have to lose their lives due to the irresponsible attitude of the system. Despite being aware of the fact that health of the victims' of the Bhopal Disaster is much more vulnerable than others during the COVID-19, the system abandoned them by withholding the treatment. As a consequence, the people who died in Bhopal during the COVID-19 were mainly the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster. The tragic and unsustainable

condition of the survivors of the Bhopal Gas Disaster intensely touched and affected a great number of analytical and right-thinking people. Whereas, most of the surveys, books, articles, reports, and analyses on the Bhopal Disaster have focused mainly on the decisions and justice leading up to the disaster on 2/3 December 1984. This paper depicts the tragic circumstances, uncertain development, and lessons learned of the victims of Bhopal, with a view to their struggles during both the catastrophe, the Bhopal Disaster, and the COVID-19. The researchers also attempt to affect the thinking of a large number of people for a better future and sustainable development of Bhopal Gas Victims'. The study is based mainly on the news reports, articles and in references to Indra Sinha's *Animal's People* that focus on the conditions and struggle of gas victims during the COVID-19 and the Bhopal Gas Disaster.

History and Life Lessons of Bhopal Gas Victims: Before and During the COVID-19 Period

The print media and writers played an important role in fabricating the memory of the disaster and in presenting the picture of the disputable sustainable development of the Bhopal Gas Disaster victims in the period from 1984 to the COVID-19 period. They not only evoke question mark on the response of the system towards the traumatized condition, but also on the certainty of the sustainable development of the victims and survivors of the World's Worst Industrial Disaster before and during the COVID-19 period.

The Bhopal Gas Disaster which took place on the mid-night of 2/3 December 1984, to date is considered to be the World's Worst Industrial Disaster. It not only resulted in a large number of loss of lives, but also makes the lives of the survivors poisonous. The actual figure of dead and injured victims of the day of the gas leak accident remains a matter of debate. The government estimates put the number of deaths in 3800 while other sources estimate that the number of deaths is higher than 15,000. On the data of estimated deaths and injured people that burst out of the day of the Gas Disaster, Dutta reported in *India Today* that, *as per official records, the Bhopal gas tragedy killed 3,787 people. The figures were updated by the Madhya Pradesh government later as the immediate official estimate had put the death toll due to gas leak from Union Carbide factory at 2,259. However, activists fighting for justice for Bhopal gas tragedy victims put the figures of death between 8,000 and 10,000* (Dutta, 2017).

A single night of the incident not only snatched the loved ones of the survivors of the disaster, but also seized their right of normal livelihood. It not only affects the lives and the environment, but also resulted in the loss of economic as well as social well-being. Apart from the loss of physical and mental well-being, the Bhopal Disaster also divides the victims' lives between *before* and *after* from that poisonous

night, *when something big like that night happens, time divides into before and after, the before time breaks up into dreams, the dreams dissolve to darkness. That's how it is here. All the world knows the name of Khaufpur, but no one knows how things were before that night* (Sinha, 2007, p. 14).

In short, the 1984 gas leak incident changed the scenario of Bhopal with its poisonous effects. After that poisoned night, the struggle as well as the sufferings of the victims continues over a relatively long period. Even after several decades, the cause of the disaster, their struggle for justice, their struggle for proper medical facilities, proper compensation, and their inhabitable or sustainable development remain under debate. The survivors still have had to continue their struggle not only for proper compensation, inhabitable sustainability, but also for the basic rights of humans. Although, during all these years the poisoned and traumatized victims learn to survive under the catastrophic consequences of the disaster. But meanwhile, on being attacked by another catastrophe, the COVID-19, the feelings of helplessness, uncertainty, and the fear of death badly affects their minds and lives again. The fact behind their fear is rational, as the toxic materials remain in the environment and make their conditions more vulnerable than others during this second whammy. The account of the aftermath of the disaster, the poisonous environment, and its catastrophic consequences are present in the narratives and reports of many news articles, surveys, and in the narrative of Indira Sinha also.

Sinha's *Animal's People* (2007) is a fictionalized account of the aftermath of the Bhopal Gas Tragedy. It focuses on the problems of the Bhopal Gas Victims, caused by the 1984 Gas Disaster. In short, to a large extent, the novel revolves around the reappraisal and the redefinition of the victimization, toxic environment, uncertainty, and injustice on a communistic level. Sinha's protagonist mentions the toxic environment in this way, *ever since that night the Kampani's factory has been locked up and abandoned ... how quiet it's. No bird song... No bee hum. Insects can't survive here. Wonderful poisons the Kampani made, so good it's impossible to get rid of them, after all these years* (Sinha, 2007, p. 29).

Animal's People also portrayed the tale of the disputable struggle of the victims, who are still suffering from various health problems and psychological issues due to the toxic environment, *we're told to appoint a new judge in the case, the hearing's again been postponed... There is still sickness all over the Khaufpur... the factory is still there, blackened by fire it's...* (Sinha, 2007, p. 364-365).

Also, in a report by Alan Taylor, it is shown how even after 30 years of the incident, the poisonous environment of Bhopal is constantly ruining and damaging the lives of the survivors. Simultaneously, it also puts a question mark on the system's response towards the sustainable development of the victims'.

Taylor reported that, *Toxic material remains, and 30 years later, many of those who were exposed to the gas have given birth to physically and mentally disabled children. For decades, survivors have been fighting to have the site cleaned up, but they say the efforts were slowed when Michigan-based Dow Chemical took over Union Carbide in 2001. Human rights groups say that thousands of tons of hazardous waste remain buried underground, and the government has conceded the area is contaminated. There has, however, been no long-term epidemiological research which conclusively proves that birth defects are directly related to the drinking of the contaminated water* (Taylor, 2014).

The poisoned environment, contaminated water, and polluted sky, which arose out of the first whammy in Bhopal resulted in the concern of sustainability and social justice for the victims. In addition, concern for justice and sustainability arose the question that who is responsible for this catastrophe and in actual what happened on the night of the disaster? And, bearing in mind, the deprived condition of the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster from the poisoned night to the COVID-19 also raises a question mark on the justice of the system. Because during the crisis of the COVID-19, survivors of the Gas Disaster whose conditions are already vulnerable due to the contaminated environment and the negligence of the system, are living under the threats of death. And as a result, the condition of the survivors, especially those who suffer from respiratory problems and heart diseases are more exposed to the possibility of being attacked by the COVID-19 in comparison to others. In a report on the tragic condition of the victims' of Bhopal Disaster during Coronavirus, Angana Chakrabarti and Soniya Agarwal reported that, *by 26 April, the city's COVID-19 toll stood at 12, of whom at least 10 had also been victims of the gas tragedy. The leak of the poisonous methyl isocyanate from the pesticide plant in 1984 had reportedly left the 10 people suffering from medical conditions such as chronic pulmonary and cardiovascular ailments, the comorbidities that made them more vulnerable to COVID-19, which attacks the respiratory system. However, families allege this wasn't the only reason their loved ones died. Speaking to The Print, they also blamed lack of medical treatment for the deaths. According to them, the patients were turned away by many hospitals, including state-run facilities earmarked to cater to the victims of the 1984 tragedy, which deprived them of timely medical attention* (Chakrabarti and Agarwal, 2020).

Hemani Sheth's report also puts the focus on the troublous, unprotected, and worrying conditions of the victims. Sheth reports observing that, *Bhopal gas tragedy survivors and their children account for nearly 80 per cent of the COVID-19 deaths in the city, according to reports. An analysis by NGOs working for the survivors of the Bhopal Gas Tragedy of 1984, said 48 of the 60 patients who had died due*

to COVID-19 in the state capital till June 11 were victims of the gas leak tragedy. Of these deaths, 74 percent were survivors of the incident, while 5 per cent were children of survivors. The Hindu reported (Sheth, 2020).

Additionally, Ashutosh Shukla's notes show the deprived and uncertain condition of the survivors of the Bhopal Disaster. Shukla reported that, *the coronavirus pandemic is turning out to be hellish for survivors of the 1984 Bhopal gas tragedy, the world's worst industrial accident. Ten of them have been killed by the virus now, sparking panic in the community that is bound by tragedy rather than caste or religion. All of Bhopal's 10 dead COVID-19 patients are gas victims* (Shukla, 2020a).

Discourses and talking points present in a report of Sharma and Manve also share the facts that how these victims' have always been abandoned by the system. In the report of Sanjay Sharma and Vishal Manve, it is reported that, *Victims of a horrifying 1984 gas leak in the Indian city of Bhopal, who have long suffered the debilitating fallout of the world's worst industrial disaster, are now dying from coronavirus, with relatives and activists accusing the government of abandoning them and withholding treatment... Now its victims make up a significant proportion of coronavirus fatalities in Bhopal – at least 20 out of 45, according to government data, while activists say 37 of the dead suffered illnesses related to the leak* (Sharma and Manve, 2020).

Anurag Dwary's report also shares the facts that how the Bhopal Gas victims' have always been neglected by the system which causes tragic, unpredictable, and unstable situations before them. In the report, Dwary reported that, *organisations working with the survivors of the 1984 Union Carbide disaster have alleged Bhopal Memorial Hospital and Research Centre is guilty of criminal negligence and mismanagement as six gas victims suffering from COVID-19 have died in the hospital's isolation ward in the last 15 days. In a letter to the Supreme Court-appointed monitoring committee, the survivors' group shared details of six Bhopal gas tragedy victims who died in the isolation ward as there was no full-time doctor posted to treat COVID-19 patients. BMHRC is a super-specialty hospital built to cater to the medical needs of Bhopal gas tragedy victims and is currently being run by Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR)* (Dwary, 2020).

Additionally to these news reports, in *Animal's People*, Sinha while presenting the tragic health condition of the victims' lives after twenty-three years of the disaster unveils their deprived condition, uncertainty, and the negligence of the system also. Sinha's protagonist reveals that, *there is still sickness all over Khaufpur, hundreds come daily to Elli doctor's clinic... the factory is still there, blackened by fire it's, but the grass is growing again, and the charred jungle is pushing out green shoots. Moons play hide and seek in the pipework of the poison*

Khana, still the foreign journalist come (Sinha, 2007, p. 365).

In this way, these reports, narratives, and discourses justified the rationality of the psychological fear, disputable state of sustainable development, and physical risk of the survivors of the Bhopal Disaster. These reports also focus on the system's now and then irresponsible and careless attitude towards the tragedy of the victims of the World's Worst Gas Disaster.

Points of discussion and debating points regarding the tragic and uncertain condition of Bhopal victims, also present the facts that how activists have always been taking a stand for these victims' well-being and sustainable development. For the victims who are being abandoned by the system again and again, from the 1984 Gas Disaster to the COVID-19 pandemic. The system has always been questioned by the activists with hope for the well-being and certain development of these victims. However, their struggles failed to bring indisputable development and complete improvement in the tragic condition of the victims of the Gas Disaster but they have continued their struggle. Pieces of evidence of these talking points are present in Sinha's narrative. In Sinha's *Animal's People*, even after twenty-three years of the disaster, a campaign is launched by activists for the good health and compensation of the victims against the justice system. However, being unable to reach any proper conclusion, instead of losing hope, the activists continue their struggle for a better future and certain development of the Bhopal victims. Activist Somraj who is also one of the victims of that poisoned night. He lost his wife, son, and his voice that night. But, instead of losing hope, he decides to stand for justice of the victims' of the disaster, *Like every Khaufpuri, Somraj hated the Kampani, he ran a poison-relief committee, which did what it could for the locals who were still coughing their lungs up so many years after that night. The people he helped were among the poorest in the city, which is why no politician gave a shit about them and hardly a lawyer would take up their claims for compensation* (Sinha, 2007, p. 33).

In addition to Somraj, in Sinha's novel, activists Nisha and Zafar also protest for victims' health problems, certain development, and compensation. Sinha also portrayed the way of struggle that is accomplished by activist Zafar, his group members, and Nisha to collect money for the victims and survivors. The protagonist narrates that Zafar, his group members, and Nisha collect, *money to help the sick. All these years after that night, he tells me, there's still no real help for those whose eyes and lungs and wombs were fucked. Of course there are government hospitals but people won't set foot in them unless they're desperate... You know what it's like in those places. You queue all day to be seen, the doctor doesn't examine you because to touch a poor person would pollute him. Barely looks at you, then writes a*

shit, tells you, take this to so-and-so's shop and say I sent you. The medicines are supposed to be given free, this is how they make money out of misery (Sinha, 2007, p. 24).

The protagonist narrates that he also stands in the queue of activists, without caring for his physical barriers. The protagonist gives the slogan that: *If we want justice, we'll have to fight for it* (Sinha, 2007, p. 34). Animal narrates the readers that how even after many attempts of their struggle for sustainable development, they are unable to reach any conclusion, but do not give up and continue their struggle, *Eyes, what else can I tell you? Life goes on. It will take time, so we're told, to appoint a new judge in the case, the hearing's again been postponed, the Kampani's still trying to find ways to avoid appearing, but Zafar is confident we'll get them in the end. There is still sickness all over Khaufpur* (Sinha, 2007, p. 364-365).

Thus, the activists continue their journey for decades, even after facing lots of hopeless and disputable situations. They have been continuously raising their voice for the victim's well-being and indisputable development, whether it is for the loss of the victims of the Bhopal Disaster or for the immorality that is happening to them during the COVID-19. According to a report published in *EconomicTimes.com* on the COVID-19 and the Bhopal Gas Victims', it is noted that, *all five persons who died due to coronavirus in Bhopal were victims of the 1984 gas tragedy in the Madhya Pradesh capital, an official said on Wednesday. On March 21, some organisations working for the survivors of the Bhopal gas tragedy had written to the authorities concerned, saying such people were five times more vulnerable to the coronavirus infection* (All 5 who died..., 2020).

A report by Vivek Trivedi also put the focus on the struggle of activists regards to the vulnerable and uncertain condition of the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster during the COVID-19. In the report, Trivedi reported that, *survivors of the 1984 gas leak tragedy have claimed that they were disproportionately falling victim to the coronavirus and comprised 75% of Bhopal's COVID-19 deaths. In a letter to Madhya Pradesh Chief Minister Shivraj Singh Chouhan, they said that those exposed to the toxic methyl isocyanate (MIC) that had spilt out of the Union Carbide's pesticide factory years ago are now bearing the brunt of the epidemic in a severe way. Deaths among the gas leak survivors caused by the novel coronavirus establishes the fact that even after 35 years of the world's worst industrial disaster, their medical condition is as fragile, having suffered permanent damage due to the exposure, the letter said* (Trivedi, 2020).

Thus, the pieces of evidence of negligence of the system and the efforts of activists regarding the justice for the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster are illustrated in articles, print media and narratives. The discourses focus the limelight on the bitter truth also

that from the day of the disaster to the COVID-19 pandemic, the victims' have always struggled to solve their problems and to drive the attention of the justice system towards their tragedy and disputable sustainable development. In short, then the victims died due to lack of proper medical care, and even now also the survivors or victims continue to face similar problems. The victims suffer from various health problems after that poisoned night, but no proper medical facilities are provided to them by the system. And, during Coronavirus the death rate of Bhopal as reported by news articles also stands as its evidence. People who died in Bhopal during Coronavirus were victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster. There is no doubt in the saying as it is evident in the above-mentioned reports and narratives that their poor health condition makes them more unsafe than others during this period of the COVID-19. But the system pays no proper attention to the gas victims and hence they die due to medical negligence. According to a report on the negligence of the system towards the lack of medical care, it is reported that, *in March, the state converted Bhopal Memorial Hospital and Research Centre into a facility for COVID-19, leaving the disaster patients with no medical care. All five patients who died of the coronavirus in Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, were survivors of the city's 1984 gas tragedy and so more vulnerable to the infection than normal individuals, PTI reported on Wednesday. On March 23, the Madhya Pradesh government had converted the Bhopal Memorial Hospital and Research Centre into a dedicated facility for the coronavirus patients, leaving survivors of the chemical disaster with no medical care. Reports said that several patients, including critical ones, were discharged to make way for the special hospital (COVID-19: Five patients..., 2020).*

Next to, Sidharth Yadav's report focuses on the negligence of the medical facilities towards the Bhopal Gas Victims during the pandemic. In the report, Yadav noted that, *After the Madhya Pradesh government designated the ICMR- run Bhopal Memorial Hospital and Research Centre (BMHRC) as the State-level COVID-19 treatment facility and stopped all other services there, anxiety gripped the Bhopal gas tragedy survivors who depend on it for super speciality care (Yadav, 2020).*

In a report published on *Economictimes.com*, the negligence of the system regarding the lack of proper medical care for the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster during the COVID-19 is also evident and noticeable. In the report of the *Economictimes.com*, it is noted that, *a hospital in the city dedicated for the treatment of gas mishap survivors has been turned into a facility for coronavirus patients, causing hardship to these people, Rachna Dhingra, member of the NGO Bhopal Group for Information and Action, told PTI. The first coronavirus victim in Bhopal, a 55-year-old man, died at a hospital on April 5 due to*

negligence of authorities, she alleged (All 5 who died..., 2020).

Likewise, in a report of Shukla, lack of proper medical care, the negligence of the system towards the survivors of the Bhopal Gas Tragedy during COVID-19, and the concern of activists are noted. Shukla thus puts the focus on these talking points that, *on March 21 – a day before the first coronavirus patient was detected in Bhopal – four activist groups had written to everyone concerned, from the Union health minister to the Bhopal district collector, pleading for special attention to gas victims as they are more vulnerable to the virus... the hospital meant exclusively for gas victims – on March 23, converted it into a COVID-19 facility, and shut the doors on gas victims... COVID-19 has since killed 10 of their own in a span of 18 days... All 10 COVID-19 deaths in Bhopal are gas victims (Shukla, 2020b).*

Besides, the depictions of the tragedy and uncertainty of the victims of the Bhopal Gas Disaster during the COVID-19, descriptions, and evidence present in news reports as well as in *Animal's People* also bear witness to their distressing lives and struggles before this pandemic. In 2015, in a news article regarding the victims' poor health and systems' negligence regarding lack of proper medical care, it is reported by the reporter that, *The Supreme Court has directed the Centre and the Madhya Pradesh government to immediately act to improve the dismal healthcare facilities provided to the survivors of the 1984 gas leak in Bhopal. Disposing a 14-year-old writ petition, the court brought to the fore a neglected aspect of the gas disaster, the continuing ill effects of which have been passed on from one generation to the next. The petition filed by Bhopal Group for Information and Action and Bhopal Gas Peedit Mahila Udyog Sangathan in 1998 had said that the survivors were entitled to free and proper medical assistance from the Union of India and state of Madhya Pradesh (Moyna, 2015).*

The same picture of medical negligence towards the victims and the survivors is also evident by Sinha's protagonist in the novel. The protagonist narrates that activists, *collects money to help the sick. All these years after that night, he tells me, there's still no real help for those whose eyes and lungs and wombs were fucked. Of course there are government hospitals but... Barely looks at you (Sinha, 2007, p. 25).*

These scenarios present by Sinha's protagonist and by the reporters thus puts the focus on the physical suffering, mental trauma, and uncertainty of the victims of the Bhopal Disaster due to improper medical facilities. It focuses on the activities of the activists and non-governmental organizations who work seriously in comparison to the governmental organizations to upgrade the minimum standard of medical care for the victims.

The above-mentioned discourses point out the distressing and traumatic lives of the victims who have

always been neglected by the system without caring about their poor health condition and sustainable development, from the poisoned night of the 1984 Gas Disaster and even during the COVID-19 pandemic. In addition, it also emphasizes the fact that the Bhopal Disaster has undoubtedly been one of the World's Worst Industrial Disaster, to date. The Bhopal Gas Disaster has not only lessons to prevent other industrial disasters in the future, but also has lessons to protect sustainable development of humanity from the negligent attitude of the system. Moreover, it also puts the focus on the fact that developments requiring nuclear and chemical manufacturing can never be positively safe for humanity.

Despite that, while seeing the demand of modern times and modern production, if these industries need to be developed, extreme safety measures should be taken by the system in the interest of humanity and the environment. As the dreadful and the rapidly regulated growth of industries remain a major threat to sustainable development of humanity and resulted in adverse physical and emotional health consequences of humans continue to happen in India. So, positive changes and safety measures are important because only these approaches can save humanity and can result indisputable sustainable development in the coming times from catastrophes and environmental degradation. Safety measures should also be taken to prevent history from being repeated so that the situation of victims of any future disaster has not been similar to that of the Bhopal Gas Disaster victims. The way the victims of Bhopal, from the 1984 Gas Disaster to the COVID-19 pandemic, have been facing similar tragic situations for decades due to the lack of proper monitoring and safety measures. Far more, the present paper seeks to present the fact in the context of poor industrialization that how the thousands of deaths in the Bhopal Gas Disaster and their struggle for decades have been proved to be a lesson for humanity as well as also for their sustainable development.

Conclusion

The Bhopal Gas Disaster and the COVID-19 pandemic cause the Bhopal Gas Victims to experience a series of horrific images and disputable situations. From the day of the disaster to the COVID-19 pandemic, the survivors of the Bhopal Gas Tragedy have to face the triple whammy. First, due to the gas leak on 2/3 December 1984, next when they have to live under the daily threats of the COVID-19 because of their ravaged health condition, and the third devastating situation is the result of the inattention of the system. From 1984 to 2020, nothing satisfactory has been changing for the victims' of the Bhopal Disaster. Still, the lives of the poisoned survivors witness lots of changes. They witness lots of changes in dates of the court cases, changes in their health status

which are getting more vulnerable day by day. And, the most important change is that then also the victims' are deprived of proper medical care and sustainable development, and now also they have to face the same tragic and uncertain situation. After the 1984 Gas Disaster, the people of Bhopal lost their loved ones and in 2020 the history repeats itself for the survivors of the World's Worst Industrial Disaster and they have to face the same sorrowful game of death. The clouds of death have always hovered over their head since the toxic incident of 1984 in different forms. These deteriorates and deprived conditions of the Bhopal Gas Victims' unveils the negligence of the system towards their toxic health to date. It also unveils the tragic, disputable, and traumatic conditions of the Bhopal victims' during the period of the triple whammy.

The 35th anniversary of the Bhopal gas catastrophe completed on December 2/3, 2019 but to date, the victims have been grappling with toxic effects, disputable sustainable development, and tragic situations. Studies, discourses, narratives and reports focus on the fact that the lives of the victims of the World's Worst Industrial Disaster have worsened due to irresponsible monitoring and the careless attitude of the system. Even after 35 years, the condition of Bhopal Gas Victims has not recovered and they have had to continue their struggle for justice and sustainable development. Victims are still deprived of proper compensation and proper medical facilities. Even in the time of the COVID-19 pandemic, they are being deprived by the system despite knowing the fact that they are much more vulnerable in comparison to others. In the present study, the researcher putting the focus on these above-discussed facts by analyzing the lessons that present by the news reports, articles and the protagonist of Sinha's *Animal's People*. The study also presents the lessons learned and the collective experiences of a poisoned community from the poisoned night and during the pandemic. In short, the present study doesn't only focus on the alarming and deprived condition of the Bhopal Gas Victims from the day of the 1984 Gas Disaster to the COVID-19 pandemic. It also presents what lessons can be learned at this tragic cost of sustainable development of humanity.

References

1. All 5 who died of COVID-19 in Bhopal were gas tragedy victims, 2020, *The Economic Times*, <https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/all-5-who-died-of-covid-19-in-bhopal-we-re-gas-tragedy-victims/articleshow/75152704.cms> (21.10.2020).
2. CHAKRABARTI A., AGRAWAL S., 2020, 35 years after Bhopal gas tragedy, coronavirus kills 10 survivors who had comorbidities, *The Print*, <https://theprint.in/health/35-years-after-bhopal-gas-tragedy-coronavirus-kills-10-survivors-who-had-comorbidities/410526/> (21.10.2020).

3. COVID-19: Five patients who died in Bhopal were vulnerable as they were victims of 1984 gas tragedy, 2020, *Scroll.in*, <https://scroll.in/latest/959272/covid-19-five-patients-who-died-in-bhopal-were-vulnerable-as-they-were-victims-of-1984-gas-tragedy> (14.11. 2020).
4. DUTTA P., 2017, Bhopal gas tragedy: What had happened this day 33 years ago that killed thousands?, *India Today*, <https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/bhopal-gas-tragedy-what-had-happened-this-day-33-years-ago-that-killed-thousands-1099247-2017-12-03> (21.10.2020).
5. DWARY A., 2020, 60% Of Covid Deaths In Bhopal Are Gas Tragedy Victims: Survivors' Group, *NDTV*, <https://www.ndtv.com/bhopal-news/coronavirus-60-of-covid-19-deaths-in-bhopal-are-gas-tragedy-victims-survivors-group-2297685> (21.10. 2020).
6. MOYNA., 2015, Supreme Court presses for better health facilities for Bhopal gas victims, *Down To Earth*, <https://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/supreme-court-presses-for-better-health-facilities-for-bhopal-gas-victims-38878> (31.10.2020).
7. SHARMA S., MANVE V., 2020, After Gas Leak Tragedy, Bhopal Victims Fall Prey To Virus, *Barrons*, <https://www.barrons.com/news/after-gas-leak-tragedy-bhopal-victims-fall-prey-to-virus-01590732011> (31.10.2020).
SHETH H., 2020, Bhopal gas tragedy victims account for majority of COVID-19 deaths in the city, seek government intervention: Report, *The Hindu Business Line*, <https://www.thehindubusinessline.com/news/national/bhopal-gas-tragedy-victims-account-for-majority-of-covid-19-deaths-in-the-city-seek-government-intervention-report/article31896556.ece> (14.11. 2020).
8. SHUKLA A., 2020a, Bhopal Coronavirus news: 10th Covid death in Bhopal, all gas victims, *Times of India*, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/10th-covid-death-in-bhopal-all-gas-victims/articleshow/75384574.cms> (21.10. 2020).
9. SHUKLA A., 2020b, 35 years on, COVID brings back nights of fear for Bhopal gas tragedy survivors, *Times of India*, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/35-years-on-covid-brings-back-nights-of-fear-for-bhopal-gas-tragedy-survivors/articleshow/75401637.cms> (21.10. 2020).
10. SINHA I., 2007, *Animal's People*, Simon & Schuster, London.
11. TAYLOR A., 2014, Bhopal: The World's Worst Industrial Disaster, 30 Years Later, *The Atlantic*, <https://www.theatlantic.com/photo/2014/12/bhopal-the-worlds-worst-industrial-disaster-30-years-later/100864/> (14.11. 2020).
12. TRIVEDI V., 2020, 75% of COVID-19 Deaths in Bhopal are Survivors of 1984 Gas Tragedy, Activists Seek CM's Intervention, *News18*, <https://www.news18.com/news/india/75-of-covid-19-deaths-in-bhopal-are-survivors-of-1984-gas-tragedy-activists-seek-cms-intervention-2682211.html> (21.10. 2020).
13. YADAV S., 2020, Anxiety grips Bhopal gas tragedy survivors as hospital designated as COVID-19 facility, *The Hindu*, <https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/anxiety-grips-bhopal-gas-tragedy-survivors-as-hospital-designated-as-covid-19-facility/article31157647.ece> (21.10. 2020).